Introduction to Implicit Bias Recognition and Management

Cristina M. Gonzalez, MD, MEd
Professor of Medicine
Department of Medicine/Division of Hospital Medicine
November 4, 2020

CLICK TO VIEW RECORDING

Poll Everywhere: Text CGONZALEZ to 22333 or pollev.com/cgonzalez
Disclosures

• I have no conflicts of interest to report.
• Consultant to medical schools on implicit bias recognition and management.
• Funding:
  > NIMHD- 1K23MD014178-01
Roadmap

• Learning objectives and session goal
• Audience reflection
• Statement of the problem
  > Health disparities
  > Patient perspectives
  > Effect on students/trainees
• Existing medical education interventions
• Recent research
• Strategy identification
• Questions
Roadmap

- Learning objectives and session goal
- Audience reflection
- Statement of the problem
  - Health disparities
  - Patient perspectives
  - Effect on students/trainees
- Existing medical education interventions
- Recent research
- Strategy identification
- Questions
Learning Objectives

• List one benefit of debriefing potentially biased encounters.
• Identify one strategy to debrief a potentially biased encounter with a learner.
• Identify one strategy engage with a learner when they are asking you about a potentially biased encounter.
Goal

Begin/Continue the discussion on the potential influence of implicit bias on our clinical and educational decision-making to raise awareness, and continue on the process to a more equitable culture of healthcare delivery and education.
Roadmap

• Learning objectives and session goal
  • Audience reflection
• Statement of the problem
  > Health disparities
  > Patient perspectives
  > Effect on students/trainees
• Existing medical education interventions
• Recent research
• Strategy identification
• Questions
I feel comfortable debriefing with learners when bias has been perceived.

Yes

No

Unsure

N/A
Did you learn about implicit bias in medical school or your post-graduate training?

Yes

No
Roadmap

- Learning objectives and session goal
- Audience reflection
  - Statement of the problem
    - Health disparities
    - Patient perspectives
    - Effect on students/trainees
- Existing medical education interventions
- Recent research
- Strategy identification
- Questions
Provider Contributions to Health Disparities: Possible Etiologies

• Implicit Bias
  > Refers to the unconscious, unintentional assumptions we make about others.

NOT:

• Explicit Bias
  > Refers to the conscious, intentional opinions we form about others (e.g. frank racism)
Systemic Contributions to Implicit Bias: Redlining

Systemic Contributions to Implicit Bias: Education

https://www.roundsconsulting.com/2018/09/14/additional-discussion-of-k12-costs-bilingual-education-proposals/
Systemic Racism and Implicit Bias

- **Systemic racism**
  - Racial inequities that occur as a product of a system. The system refers to the collection of policies and practices that are perpetuated by maintenance of the status quo.

- **Implicit bias**
  - The unconscious, unintentional assumptions we make due to unconscious mental associations about different social groups.
Systemic Racism and Implicit Bias

- **Systemic racism**
  > Racial inequities that occur as a product of a **system**. The system refers to the collection of policies and practices that are perpetuated by maintenance of the **status quo**.

- **Implicit bias**
  > The unconscious, unintentional assumptions we make due to **unconscious mental associations** about different social groups.
Systemic Contributors to Implicit Bias

- Media portrayal
- Formed at an early age

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lFjWA5w74nY

https://boingboing.net/2015/03/31/arrested-for-same-crime-in-ne.html
Implicit Bias Contributes to Health Disparities

Implicit Bias

Clinical Decision-Making

Communication Patterns

Implicit Bias Contributes to Health Disparities

- Clinical Decision-Making
- Communication Patterns


Implicit Association Test (IAT) sample screens and stimuli. This figure displays sample screens and stimuli from the *race preference* (black-white/good-bad) IAT.
Blair IV, Steiner JF, Hanratty R, et al. An investigation of associations between clinicians' ethnic or racial bias and hypertension treatment, medication adherence and blood pressure control. Journal of general internal medicine 2014;29:987-95

http://www.medicalsymptomsguide.com/hypertension-symptoms.html
Implicit Bias Contributes to Health Disparities

Communication Patterns:
Verbal dominance during interviews

Patient Perceptions

- With increasing provider bias patients perceive:
  - Less patient-centeredness\(^1-^3\)
  - More difficulty remembering details of conversation\(^4\)
Effects on Students/Trainees

- CHANGES\textsuperscript{5}
- Role modeling\textsuperscript{5,6}
- Biased language in evaluations\textsuperscript{7}
- Bias toward trainees (and faculty too) from the patients\textsuperscript{8}

Roadmap

- Learning objectives and session goal
- Audience reflection
- Statement of the problem
  > Health disparities
  > Patient perspectives
  > Effect on students/trainees
- Existing medical education interventions
- Recent research
- Strategy identification
- Questions
Existing Medical Education Innovations\textsuperscript{13-15}

- Awareness
- Reflections
- Narratives
- Perspective-taking exercises
- Strategy identification
Limitations of Current Interventions

- Unintended consequences of increased awareness
- Hidden curriculum undermines the formal curriculum
Roadmap

• Learning objectives and session goal
• Audience reflection
• Statement of the problem
  > Health disparities
  > Patient perspectives
  > Effect on students/trainees
• Existing medical education interventions
• Recent research
• Strategy identification
• Questions
Implicit Bias

Good Intentions

Explicit Bias

Conscious awareness

Implicit Bias

SES

Access

Patient Behaviors

Delivery of Care

Healthcare Disparities

Conscious awareness
Implicit Bias

Good Intentions

Explicit Bias

Conscious awareness

Implicit Bias

Delivery of Care

Healthcare Disparities
Skills-Based Approach

- Informed by rigorous needs assessment
- Qualitative research
  > Patients
  > Students
  > Faculty
Implicit bias curriculum development

- Resistance due to lack of buy-in or fear
- Cognitive dissonance created by the hidden curriculum
- Flattening the hierarchy and reducing shame
- Opportunities to enhance instruction
- Student engagement in present & future instruction

Cognitive dissonance created by the hidden curriculum
Perceived Facilitation Ability

Individual Faculty Member Factors

Other Faculty and Student Resistance

Faculty Development Programs

Institutional Values

Gonzalez CM, et. al.. How to Make or Break Implicit Bias Instruction: Implications for Curriculum Development. 
Faculty Introductory Seminars

Self-Monitoring

Seeking Consultation

Perspective Taking

Creating a safe space
Skills-Based Interventions for Medical Students

- Compulsory curriculum
  - Reflection and strategy identification
- MS1 Elective
  - Novel educational strategies
    - Active learning
      - Perspective taking
      - Bystander training
    - Role-plays
    - Structured debrief
    - Skill development and practice

MS1 Elective- Program Evaluation

- Focus groups
  > Thematic content analysis
  > Three themes
    • Student engagement can be enhanced
    • Instruction is empowering
    • It can be done!
- Post-session debriefs
  > Lessons learned

Lessons Learned: Strategies

Atenolol vs Carvedilol
Lessons Learned

- Paulo Freire’s Theory of Problem Posing Education
- Social learning theory

Diagram:
- Teacher-Student
- Student-Teacher
- Self-efficacy
- Behavior
- Environment

The diagram illustrates the interplay between teacher-student interactions, student-teacher interactions, self-efficacy, behavior, and the environment, highlighting the dynamic nature of educational processes.
Roadmap

- Learning objectives and session goal
- Audience reflection
- Statement of the problem
  > Health disparities
  > Patient perspectives
  > Effect on students/trainees
- Existing medical education interventions
- Recent research
- **Strategy identification**
- Questions
Identify one strategy that you yourself could implement to discuss an instance where you suspect implicit bias is affecting a clinical encounter that you are observing.
Identify one strategy engage with a learner when they are asking you about a potentially biased encounter
Roadmap

• Learning objectives and session goal
• Audience reflection
• Statement of the problem
  > Health disparities
  > Patient perspectives
  > Effect on students/trainees
• Existing medical education interventions
• Recent research
• Strategy identification
• Questions
THANK YOU!

- Questions?
- Please take the anonymous survey
  > Left side is how you felt **BEFORE** the session (in retrospect)
  > Right side is how you feel **CURRENTLY**
- https://uclahs.az1.qualtrics.com/jfe/form/SV_4IoNc0Q3ECUTeC1
Acknowledgements

• Paul R. Marantz, MD, MPH
• Monica L. Lypson, MD, MHPE
• Emily Kintzer, MD
• Sydney Walker
• Natalia Rodriguez
• Julie List, LCSW
• Study participants
• Small group facilitators
• Einstein Students


